Original article



A Review of Torque Ripple Minimization Strategies in Switched Reluctance Machines

Zainab M. Gwoma *1, Kayode A. Popoola 2, Sunusi S. Adamu 2, M. Buhari 2

¹Department of Electrical and Electronics Engineering, Bayero University Kano, PMB 1069 Bama Road, Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria. ²Department of Electrical Engineering, Bayero University Kano, PMB 3011, Gwarzo Road, Kano State, Nigeria.

Department of Electrical Engineering, Dayero Oniversity Rano, 1 MD 5011, Gwarzo Road, Rano State,

*Corresponding author: Zainab M. Gwoma; zee10musa@unimaid.edu.ng

Received 30 January 2023;Accepted 20 February 2023;Published 25 February 2023

Abstract

Switched reluctance machines (SRMs) have proven to be reliable, efficient and cost effective over other conventional motors. However, its major drawback lies in its highly nonlinear characteristics which makes it to produce torque ripples, acoustic noise and vibration. A number of methods have been proposed for the minimization of the ripples produced by either changing and improving the structure and geometry of the motor or via a number of control strategies. Artificial intelligence techniques have also been explored for the minimization of these ripples. This paper reviews the state of the art on various control strategies for torque ripple minimization of the SRM. It is expected that this review paper will serve as an underlying platform for researchers meaning to traverse control of SRMs for further improvement.

Keywords: switched reluctance machines, torque ripple minimization, torque.

I. Introduction

The SRM is making rapid progress in the industry and has become a highly popular machine of choice due to its robust and simple structure, high torque to inertia ratio, low cost, high efficiency and reliability, fault tolerance capabilities and suitability for variable speed operations. The SRM as a Motor is well known for over 150 years whereas the generating mode, SRG has created considerable interest of recent [1]. The SRM is referred to as a doubly salient pole due to the salient pole structure of its stator and rotor [2]. This is not unconnected with the fact that the machines have no brushes and Permanent Magnet on the rotor and this makes it robust and able to operate at very high speeds. The machine is commercially applied in washing machines, vacuum cleaners, water pumps, automatic doors, hybrid electrical vehicle, automotive application, electrified power train, starter generator, turbocharger application, gas turbine textile machines, and a host of others [3].

However, despite these advantages, the SRM has a number of disadvantages which has limited its wider applicability. Some of the disadvantages include: its highly nonlinear characteristics due to its salient pole structure and magnetic saturation along the flux path [2,3]. This non-linearity causes torque ripples, vibrations and acoustic noise which are all undesirable. As a result, it has become imperative for researchers to devise a means of reducing these undesirable characteristics- majorly the torque ripple- so as to close the existing gap between the conventional machine and the SRM.

Two methods are primarily used for torque reduction: the first is to improve the magnetic design of the motor by modification of the structure and geometry of the SRM. The second method uses advanced electronic control techniques. In the first method, the reduction in torque ripple is usually obtained by changing the structure of the stator and rotor poles [4], however this has a

corresponding effect on the motor torque. In the electronic approach, control parameters such as voltage and current levels, turn off and turn on angles are optimized. This method is also at the expense of average torque as the machine will not attain the optimal power levels. Figure 1 depicts the various methodologies for torque ripple minimization (TRM).



Fig.1: TRM methodologies [4]

Extensive research has been carried out on the various TRM methodologies. [5-9] optimizes motor design of the SRM while [10-13] utilizes advanced electronic control methods.

Torque-production mechanisms for switched reluctance motor drive are both current and position dependent. [14] Shows an earlier method of torque ripple minimization where the shape of the torque/angle/current can be determined by a series of static and dynamic measurements. The author in [15] employed a by-cubic interpolation to model the nonlinear data by experimentation and optimal pre-calculation of the position of a four phase 4kW SRM. The result produced a torque controller with low toque ripple.

In [16], the authors used PWM control techniques to reduce torque ripples by using a current control strategy during commutation. [17] proposes a ripple minimization strategy based on the Sliding Mode Control (SMC) which compensates the low frequency oscillations in the output of the torque. This method employed a completely analog system as it uses a sensor to sense the position of the rotor. [18] Implements a simple method by minimizing the ripple independent of the stator structure. Also, TRM was achieved independent of the machine design using Finite Element Analysis (FEA). In [19], a novel method of segment type SRM with two-steps skew/slide rotor to reduce torque ripple was proposed. The machine characteristics was compared to the experimental machine. In this method, however, there was a reduction in the average torque of the machine. [20] Improves the dynamic performance of the SRG by employing criteria based on machine design parameters and structure of the geometry. With this defined, an optimal pointer to SR topologies for TRM was obtained in addition to the imposition of a magneto motive force (MMF) from a trapezoidal phase reference. This was synchronized with the rotor position and the torque ripples shown to be effectively minimized.

Another well-known control approach to torque ripple minimization is the Torque sharing Function (TSF). The TSF method regulates the torque production of the individual phases to distribute the reference torque among all the phases, while keeping the sum of all the individual torque references equal to the required torque [21][22-25] employs Torque control techniques for ripple minimization. [26-28] employs a TSF for reducing torque ripples in SRM. An attempt has been made in [29] to minimize the torque ripple of an SRM through current profiling using a combination of machine design and control algorithm. Simulation of the dynamic model in MATLAB/Simulink environment considering machine nonlinearities, electrical and magnetic loss and mutual coupling was done and experimental verification validated showing a good correlation between experimental results and simulation. However, efficiency of the SRM was conceded to be able to meet desired torque ripple improvements.

Aide Xu et al [30] compared the optimized scheme of the Direct Torque Control, DTC and Direct Instantaneous Torque Control DITC with a new method based on Model Predictive Flux Control, MPFC to reduce Torque ripple in SRM. They found that this approach can only partly overcome the torque ripple as compared with the Optimized DTC and DITC methods. In [31], Nan Wu et al presented a Torque Ripple Minimization strategy in SRM for application in water pumping using Model Predictive Control, MPC. They found that the presence of MPC makes the use of a converter unessential, thereby reducing cost. A third order response surface model was applied to build a multi objective function considering efficiency improvement and torque ripple reduction was described in [32], simulation and experimental results returned a good compromise between SRG high efficiency and low torque ripple.

Satisfactory control performance is difficult to achieve using traditional controllers such as the proportional, integral and/or derivative (PI, PD, and PID) controllers as they can only be tuned to obtain desired performance under a specific set of operating conditions. However, its performance deteriorates significantly as the operating conditions vary with increasing nonlinearity of the SRG. Hence, artificial intelligence control techniques such as Fuzzy Logic (FL) [33-38], Artificial Neural Network (ANN) [39], Bacteria Foraging Optimization (BFO) [40] Genetic Algorithm (GA) [41] are employed for torque ripple minimization which allows for better performance. [42-44] gives an extensive review/literature survey of related approaches adopted for torque ripple minimization in SRM

drives. This work will focus on a review of the various research work carried out on the SRG and their control strategies

II. Electromechanical structure of SRG

The SRM has a structure where both its rotor and stator poles protrude into the airgap (salient pole). The rotor and stator poles are made up of steel laminations and only the stator poles have windings concentrated round them [39]. Also, there exists no permanent magnet (PM) on the rotor, but rather, a gear like chunk of laminated steel. This lack of PM and windings on the rotor means the magnetic field has to be created from a source of external supply [40]. The stator pole windings are connected in series with the opposite stator poles to form a phase. Some typical SRG configurations include a three phase 6 stator, 4 rotor 6/4 machine configuration, a four- phase 8/6, three- phase 12/8 machine, etc. [41] Figure 2 shows a conventional four phase 8/6 and three phase 12/8 SRM.



Fig.2: Switched reluctance generator structure (a) four-phase 8/6, (b) three-phase 12/8 [3]

III. Background on torque ripple

Torque ripples are inherent in SRMs due to the salient structure and excessive magnetic saturation of the machine. Its flux linkage, inductance and torque are highly coupled with a rotor position and phase current [48]. These features make the SRG to be highly nonlinear. This nonlinearity thus introduces high torque ripples, vibrations and acoustic noise during the operation of the SRM. By neglecting the effect of magnetic saturation, an idealized induction profile is obtained [21]. The torque relationship between the idealized inductance profile and phase current is as shown in figure 3.



Fig. 3: Torque relationship between the idealized inductance profile and the phase current. [21]

Torque ripple is defined as the difference between maximum and minimum total instantaneous torques expressed as percentage of average torque [48].

Where T_{inst} is the instantaneous torque produced during every switching and T_{ave} is the average torque value.

Torque ripples in the SRM is mainly caused due to the switching of phase currents into its windings and the highly nonlinear nature of phase inductance variation when the rotor rotates. With the successive phase windings excited in sequence to produce continuous rotation, the total torque is the sum of the torque generated due to the currents in the outgoing phase and the current in the incoming phase. The torque pulsations are thus encountered at the instants of current switching from one active phase to the other. These currents are controlled independently.

The total instantaneous torque of motor is given by sum of all the individual phase torques.

$$T_{total} = \sum_{phases} T_{phases} (i, \theta)$$
(3)

The average torque expression is thus obtained by integrating equation (3) over a time interval T.

Where: θ is the Rotor angle, *i* is the phase current, L is the Phase inductance, T_{ave} is the average Torque and T_{total} is the total Torque.

IV. Review of torque control techniques

1. Changing motor geometry and structure

[49] Proposes a new stator pole shape with non-uniform airgap and a pole shoe on the rotor pole for the minimization of the torque ripple. Numerical analysis using finite element method (FEM) and optimization was carried out with the optimized stator and rotor giving a reduced torque ripple. In [50], an effective torque mitigation technique for double stator switched reluctance motor (DSSRM) using rotor shape optimization technique was presented. This method was based on shape optimization of the rotor for redistribution of the flux so that the inductance profile has smoother variation as the rotor poles move into alignment with excited stator poles. However, this method results in lower torque pulsations without significant reduction in the average torque. [51] Describes a proposal for a new stator pole face having a nonuniform air-gap and a pole shoe attached to the lateral face of the rotor pole. These additions minimize the undesired torque ripple. The effects of each design parameter were investigated using a time-stepping finiteelement method. The parameters were optimized by utilizing response surface method (RSM) combined with (1+1) evolution strategy. It was shown, through numerical tests, that the optimized shape gives higher average torque and drastically reduced torque ripple.

2. Indirect torque control

Torque in AC machines can be controlled by converting torque reference into equivalent phase current references. In an SRM, torque can be indirectly controlled by controlling the current. This methodology of torque control in an SRM is called the indirect torque control. Figure 4 shows a basic block diagram of this technique.



Fig.4: Indirect Torque Control for SRM [44].

However, as a result of torque dependence on rotor position, the torque to current conversion is very difficult to achieve in SRMs. It therefore becomes very difficult to obtain an analytical expression between the torque, current and rotor position. Existing methods in literature for the torque to current conversion in SRMs includes the use of look-up table to store the torque-current -rotor position characteristics [52]. In [53], a torque control method that was based on exponential function to reduce torque ripples was proposed. This method directly translated the reference torque into the reference current using the torque formulae and lookup table. The system was verified on a simulation model of a 3kw 12/8 poles switched reluctance motor. Results obtained show the effectiveness of the proposed method in reducing torque ripples. [54], reports a research based on determination of optimum geometry that minimizes torque ripple. The effect of magnetic circuit parameters on the torque ripple over a wide speed range was undertaken. The prediction of torqueposition and permeance -position characteristics of a doubly-salient magnetic structure as a function of exciting MMF for a specified normalized position was also studied. However, simplifying assumptions such as the fact that the magnetic circuit behind the doubly-salient air gap region having negligible MMF drop making the airgap to be subject to an excitation level dictated by the phase current and constant excitation level irrespective of position gives an oversimplification of the problem and allows far reaching conclusions to be drawn.

In [55], neural network was used to extract the data required to predict the torque produced by a given geometry and excitation so that the static torque curve can be obtained and torque ripple reduced. Neural network is used because the objective function cannot be explicitly expressed as a mathematical function of the objective variables However, this method requires intensive online computations and its prediction accuracy is very low.

The authors in [56] used a method of indirect torque control and Iterative Learning control (ILC) by distribution of the motor torque among the phases using TSF and converting the phase torque references to phase current references. However, due to linear magnetization characteristics, an invertible torque function was obtained which leads to torque error as the motor enters into magnetic saturation. Thus, the authors introduced ILC to add a compensation current to the nominal phase current references so that torque error was eliminated.

3. Direct torque control

The DTC scheme avoids the complex process of torque-to-current conversion which is common in indirect torque control scheme. DITC comprises a digital torque hysteresis-controller, which generates the switching signals for all activated machine phases. The reference torque is compared with the actual generated torque and given to a hysteresis torque controller which outputs torque increase or decrease. If the torque generated by the motor is less than reference torque, the torque is increased by turning on the top and bottom switches of the converter to enter into state 1. If the torque developed is more than the reference, then it is reduced by turning off either top or bottom switch or both the switches to enter into state 0 or -1[57]. A block diagram of DITC is shown in Figure 5.



Fig. 5: Simple Block diagram of DITC [58]

In [59], the authors employed the direct instantaneous torque control (DITC) to control the motor torque by means of switching table whose inputs are signals of flux and torque error. DITC does not use any current waveform to inhibit torque ripple, but directly regulates the instantaneous torque. [22] Employs a new instantaneous torque controller by adding a PI controller before the instantaneous torque controller and a change in commutation zones. It is expected that the PI controller will produce higher error values which leads to an early response of the torque hysteresis regulators. The integral gain contributes to reduce the steady state error. As a result, the instantaneous torque controller is able to anticipate future torque values and thus execute proper control action to avoid exceeding the torque ripple limit. The author then simulated the PI-DITC model in MATLAB/Simulink environment and the effectiveness of the method established when compared to experimental results. However, the effectiveness of the proposed model was only tested in low speed drives as its effect on high speed SRM drives requires further research. [60] Investigated a DITC for switched reluctance drives. It implemented DITC without the use of the rotor position estimation system. The digital torque hysteresis controller employed the reference torque and instantaneous torque value to generate the switching signals for the converter based on predefined switching angles.

In [61], a novel Lyapunov function-based direct torque controller (DTC) to minimize the torque ripple in an SRM drive system is presented. The Lyapunov function based direct torque controller was proposed in this paper to avoid the nonlinear dynamic relationship between the applied phase voltage and the resulting motor torque for a DTC and also the fixed sampling frequency which results in large amount of torque ripples. The hysteresis controller applies full positive negative values of the dc-link voltage to the phase winding, at variable switching frequency to keep the output torque within a narrow band of the reference. In the Lyapunov function-based controller, the feedback gain is varied using a heuristic technique as the stability of the proposed controller is ensured by the direct method of Lyapunov. Experimental results for a 1-hp, 4-phase SRM demonstrates the efficiency of the proposed torque control scheme. Despite the simple structure of DITC, it requires complex switching rules for smooth torque generation during commutation. In addition, its control performance is dependent on the switching rules and sampling period in the digital controller.

4. Torque sharing function

In the Torque Sharing Function (TSF), torque production for the individual phases is regulated so as to distribute the reference torque among each of the individual phases while at the same time keeping the sum of all individual torque reference equal to the required torque [21]. TSF s are usually classified according to the various functions that are used to implement them. Some of these functions are; linear based [15] which resulted in a single-input, linear, decoupled output torque controller that provided a low torque ripple; cubic [56]; sinusoidal [16]; in which torque produced by the phases, during phase commutation changes with the rotor position; and exponential. However, a major drawback of this method is that effect of back emf and incremental inductance was not considered [62]. The primary objective for the selection of TSFs is in minimizing torque ripple and maintaining the torque sharing. Since selection of TSF will be influenced by the phase current reference, a secondary objective of the TSF is to minimize copper loss. [60-63] reports several TSF for the minimization of torque ripples in SRMs.

Figure 6 shows a block diagram of TSF torque minimization scheme.



Fig.6: Block diagram of torque minimization with TSF [27]

An off line TSF for ripple reductions in SRM was proposed in [28] with two secondary objective functions; minimization of copper loss and derivatives of current references. A Lyapunov factor was used to compare with the convention. This factor was selected based on a trade-off between the copper loss and torque-speed performance. The comparisons were made in terms of operating efficiency and toque-speed performance. With the machine operating in both saturation and magnetic linear regions. Results obtained shows the reduction in torque ripples of the SRM with no corresponding increase in phase current reference and thus no increment in copper loss. [64] employs an online TSF for torque ripple minimization in SRM drives. In this, two modes are defined during commutation. These are modes for the absolute rate of change of flux linkages for incoming and outgoing phases. The total torque was determined by the phase with lower absolute rate of change of flux linkages rather than the phase with higher.

The proposed TSF was verified via both simulations and experiments. Results obtained show that the proposed TSF has higher average torque, and much lower torque ripples compared to conventional TSFs. A torque ripple minimization scheme using a TSF based FLC is presented in [36]. This method gives the robustness at the torque error and uncorrected data of the TSF such that when the torque ripple is generated, FLC compensated the error instantaneously. This method has the added advantage that the controller can track the torque under a wrong TSF condition.

[11] presents a valuable approach to select a reasonable TSF in order to implement TRM control to realize large speed range and high operating efficiency. It proposes an improved TSF for torque ripple minimization in SRM and compares the linear, sinusoidal, cubic and exponential TSFs with their effects of turn on and overlap angle on two optimization criteria which are the maximization of speed and minimization of copper loss for a given torque. From the evaluation of the four TSFs, the effective rate-of-change of the flux linkage and the copper loss were found to be dependent on both the turn-on angle and the overlap angle for a specific torque. GA was thus used to optimize these two criteria so as to minimize both the effective rate-of-change of flux linkage (maximize the speed range) and the square of rms current (minimize the copper loss). The paper presented valuable approach to select a reasonable TSF in order to implement TRM control to realize large speed range and high operating efficiency.

5. Intelligent controllers for torque ripple minimization

Intelligent controllers such as neural network, fuzzy logic, genetic algorithm and other artificial intelligence based techniques are used to implement adaptive control for torque ripple minimization in SRM drives. The basic premise in the intelligent controller is the incorporation of online learning involving the simultaneous excitation of more than one phase winding and the use of fuzzy adaptive system to represent current as a nonlinear function of phase [43].

[65-71] reports on the adaptive neuro fuzzy logic controller for torque ripple minimization. [66] presents an application of adaptive neuro-fuzzy (ANFIS) control for switched reluctance motor (SRM) speed. This method has the advantages of expert knowledge of the fuzzy inference system and the learning capability of neural networks. The author in [67] proposes using the ANFIS for torque ripple reduction of SRM drive. The proposed system was simulated using MATLAB/Simulink and simulation results compared with single layer SRM show a significant reduction in speed settling time as well as motor torque ripples. In [72], an adaptive neuro fuzzy inference system for torque-ripple reduction in switched reluctance machines is presented. Fuzzy parameters were initially chosen randomly and thereafter adjusted to optimize the control. The controller produces smooth torque up to the motor base speed. The torque is generated over the maximum positive torqueproducing region of a phase thus increasing the torque density and avoids high current peaks.

Genetic Algorithm (GA) is a bio- inspired optimization algorithm that has been used in many complex engineering problems based on its ability to attain near optimum solutions. However, GA suffers from long processing time to find optimum solution and may sometimes attain a local minimum instead of global minimum. In spite of this, it has been successfully implemented in various torque ripple minimization methodologies. In [73], GA is applied for optimal design of PI controller coefficient considering minimum torque ripple as a cost function in simulation tests. Result obtained via MATLAB/Simulink simulation was validated with an 8/6 SRM. A control mechanism for torque ripple minimization of SRM is presented in [41] which reduces the torque ripple using nondominated sorting GA (NSGA-II). This is a modified version of NSGA-I. The control scheme consists of a proportional-integral (PI) speed controller in the outer loop, PI current controller in the inner loop along with control of turn on and turn off angles for a 3 phase, 6/4 switched reluctance motor. Statistical performance of the Integral Squared Error (ISE) parameters for 20 independent trials of the SRM are considered with results showing that NSGA-II based controllers give better performance in terms of lesser torque ripple and quick settling time. However, this method has only been validated by simulation.

[74] proposes a torque minimization scheme using a combination of Seeker Optimization Algorithm and Finite Element Method (FEM). The author used spline interpolation to fit continuous curve to energy-angle points from which torque was calculated by differentiation. An appropriate independent geometrical variable for the motor optimization was selected and a suitable objective function obtained. In [75], a simulation electromagnetic model was introduced using ANSYS finite element package for the SRG. The results explicitly show that the flux density waveforms were completely non-sinusoidal. The authors further observed that the optimal turn- on and turn- off angles obtained depended totally on the speed of the rotor.

[76-80] employs Particle Swarm Optimization (PSO) in order to solve the problem that the current stochastic and deterministic optimization methods have not yet obtained the perfect solution to. It describes the design optimization procedure of SRM using the improved PSO with the objective of maximizing average torque and minimizing torque ripple. It optimizes the motor design and achieves satisfactory results. Naggar H.S., in [81] introduced a new method of Maximum Power Point Tracking, (MPPT) of SRG for wind system in which the classical Hill Climb Searching HCL was modified using Artificial Neural Network, (ANN) under a wide range of speed variation and was a success. However, the authors established that a malfunction can occur as a result of rapid change in wind speed. [82] compared Multi Objective Particle Swarm Optimization (MOPSO) technique with Artificial Neural Network, (ANN) and there was a significant improvement in the efficiency of the system and torque ripples were minimized with MOPSO. A simulation of SRG driver in MATLAB/Simulink and a real time control of the SRG on a Digital signal processor kit (DS1103) to determine the performance of the SRG was presented in [83]. The output voltage of the SRG was controlled by a Proportional-Integral (PI) voltage Controller. The results in this paper established that changes in phase currents were affected by selecting the turn-on and turn-of angles of the SRG. Table 1 presents a brief tabulated review of some control strategies implemented in SRMs with their limitations.

Referense	Title	Methodology	Finding	Remarks	Limitation
Amissa	State of the Art	A review of recent	Due to its geometry	Further research is	To analyse the
Arifin et	Switched	development of SR machine	simplicity and	required to fill the	machine thoroughly,
al, 2012	Reluctance	operating in generating	advantages such as	commercial gap on	various changes on
	Generator	mode in both low and high	robustness, absence of	SRG with the aid of a	the parameters have
		speed operations	permanent magnet and	comprehensive	to be made which
			windings on the rotor,	modelling software.	may be time
			etc, the SRG is a good		consuming and may
			candidate for variable		incur high cost.
			speed operation		
Mohamed	Sensorless	A modified Multi objective	Simulation result	The modified MOPSO	Torque Ripples not
E.Metally,	Control of SRG	PSO was used for wind	support the feasibility of	improves the overall	completely
2017	with Maximum	maximum power point	the proposed Torque	efficiency and	eliminated. There is
	Power Extraction	tracking MPPT and ripple	ripple minimization and	minimizes the Torque	still room for
	Wind Driven	minimization. MOPSO	MPPT with Sensorless	Ripples	improvement
	Based on MO-	technique was compared	control technique.		
	PSO	with ANN and the result			
		shows great improvement			
		with MOPSO			
Pedro	Design of	Computational experiment	Simulation and	The technique reduces	System Efficiency
Jose dos	computational	is applied to determine	experimental result	computational effort	was more prioritized
Santos	Experiment for	Optimal Firing angles and	show a good	and provides a clear	than Torque Ripple
Neto et	Performance	DC link voltage. A third	compromise between	massive Data	Reduction
al., 2018	Optimization of	order response surface	SRG High efficiency	simulation framework.	
	SRG in Wind	model based on space	and low Torque Ripple.		
	Systems	filling designs is applied to			
		build multi objective			
		function. Hysteresis and			

Table 1: A tabulated review of some control strategies considered in SRM with their constraints.

-					
		single pulse current control			
		speed operation respectively			
Naggar H.	Artificial Neural	Modified Toque Ripple	Results show good	Simulation results	Although the MPPT
Saad et	Controller for	Minimization algorithm of	response of the system	show good agreement	technique does not
al., 2018	Torque Ripple	4-phase 8/6 poles SRG	to the wind speed	and feasibility of the	depend on the load,
	Control and	using ANN control, also	changes. Generator	technique for TRM	system and wind
	Maximum Power	MPPT was carried out using	current is symmetrical	and MPPT	characteristics, it
	Extraction for	Technique in ANN	and nearly smooth the		could mainunction
	Driven by	reeningue in Arviv	has smoothed waveform		in wind speed.
	Switched		with minimum torque		
	reluctance		ripples.		
	Generator				
Aide Xu	A new Control	Control Methods based on	It was found that the	Simulation and	DITC has large peak
et al, 2019	Method Based on Direct Torque	DIC and MPC are used to	new approach can partly	Experimental results	currents and
	Control (DTC)	SRM	with the optimized DTC	steady state and	rules, because firing
	and Model		and DITC METHODS	dynamic state to	angles needs to be
	Predictive Control			demonstrate the	optimised online
	(MPC) to reduce			validity of the new	from different
	Torque Ripple in			approach	conditions, the
	SKM				simulation and
					experimental tests.
Zeki	Control of	Simulation of SRG driver in	Simulation results were	Changes in Phase	Wasn't tested on a
Omac et	Switched	MATLAB/SIMULINK was	accurate when	currents are effected	fixed speed wind
al, 2021	Reluctance	performed and real time	compared with	by selecting turn-on	turbine generator
	Generator in Wind	implementation control of	experimental results.it	and turn- off angle.	
	Application for	SRG was carried out on a Digital signal processor to	was also found that selecting turn-off angle		
	Variable Speeds	determine the performance	after un-aligned rotor		
	, analise species	of the controller. Output	position and the		
		voltage was also controlled	Changes in Phase		
		by a PI voltage Controller	Current turn-on angle		
			before aligned position		
			increases the phase		
Hojjat	Multi-Objective	Optimization of turn-on and	it was found that the	Ultimately, the	The effect of firing
Hojiabadi	Optimization and	turn- off angles in the	system has simple	simulation results of a	angles were not
et al, 2021	Online Control of	offline mode using PSO	structure, low execution	typical 3-phase 6/4	studied
	SRG for wind	algorithm to control system	time, and efficient	generator using	simultaneously as
	Power Application	in the online mode with	convergence rate that	MAILAB confirmed	seen in some
	Application	inical interpolation.	machine characteristics	presented control	previous work.
				strategy that can find	
				applications in the	
				future.	

A comprehensive summery of Torque Control Techniques presented in this paper; showcasing there features, advantaged as well as limitations are as shown in Table 2.

Table 2: Summery	of the features,	advantages and	limitations o	f torque control	techniques	of the SRMs.

	Features	Advantages	Limitation
Changing Motor	-Provides low starting current.	-low energy use	-difficult to control
geometry and	-high torque		-low torque pulsations with no significant
structure			reduction in average torque
Indirect torque	-Torque is indirectly controlled by controlling	Directly translates	-complex torque to current conversion
control	the current	reference torque into	system.
		reference current using	Difficult to obtain analytical expression
		torque formula and	between the Torque, Current and rotor
		lookup table	position.
Direct Torque	-directly regulates the instantaneous torque.	-integral gain reduces	-model was only tested on low-speed drives.
Control	-does not use current ripple to inhibit torque	steady state error.	Its effect on high-speed drives requires
	ripple.		further research.
	-adds a PI Controller before the instantaneous		
	Torque controller		

Torque Sharing	-reference torque is been distributed among	-minimizes copper loss	-does not consider effect of back emf and
Function	the individual phases.	-high operating	incremental conductance.
	-sum of all individual torques still remains	efficiency and large	
	equal to the required torque.	speed range.	
Intelligent	Intelligent controllers incorporates online	Results obtained were	Sometimes, does not easily converge due to
controller	learning involving the simultaneous	satisfactory and by far	its non-linear characteristics.
	excitation of more than one phase winding.	the best out of the five.	

V. Challenges and future recommendation

SRMs are gradually becoming a good alternative compared to the conventional Permanent magnet machines. This is not unconnected with their low cost, Robustness, high speed, among others; despite these advantages however, its market attractiveness is highly reduced due to its non-linear characteristics that brings about torque ripples and noise which are both undesirable.

The generating mode of SRMs require a substantial amount of study in other to harness the full potential of the machine. Researchers are expected to work extensively on the Machine as it has very vast research area and too little attention. This will in turn improve its production and bring it more into the market.

VI. Conclusion

Due to the growing interest in SRM drives owing to their suitability for direct drive application, as well as its low cost, researchers recognize the need to resolve the high torque ripple and acoustic noise associated with this drive. A brief overview of related literature and published work on the torque ripple reduction and control of switched reluctance motor drives has been presented in this paper.

References

- [1] D. Susitra, E. Annie Elisabeth Jebaseeli and S.Paramasivam. "Switched Reluctance Generator-Modelling, Design, Simulation, Analysis and Control, A Comprehensive Review". International Journal of Computer Applications (0975-8887), 2010. Volume 1-No.2 pp12-25
- [2] Amissa Arifin, Ibrahim Al-Bahadly and Subhas Chandra Mukhopadhyay. "State of the Art Switched Reluctance Generator". Journal of Energy and Power Engineering, volume 4, pp447-458 2012. Journal Web page: http://www.SciRP.org/journal/epe
- [3] Hojjat Hajiabadi, Mohsen Farshad and Mohammad Ali Shamsinejad. "Multi-Objective Optimization and Online Control of Switched Reluctance Generator for Wind Power Application" International Journal of Industrial Electronics, Control and Optimization (IECO), Volume 4, no. 1, pp33-45, 2021.
- [4] L. Enriques, R. Olim, B. Ranco, and W. Uemitsu. "Review of the Ripple Reduction Strategies in Srm," Congr. Bras. Autom., pp. 1164-1169, 2002.
- [5] R. Krishnan, R. Arumugam, and J. F. Lindsay, "Design Procedure for Switched-Reluctance Motors," IEEE Trans. Ind. Appl., vol. 24, no. 3, pp. 456-461, 1988.
- [6] Q. Ming, D. Lei, H. Xiaojiang, and L. Xiaozhong, "A rapid design method for high-speed aeronautic switched reluctance generator," 2011 Int. Conf. Electr. Inf. Control Eng., pp. 1937-1941, 2011.
- [7] Z. G. Sun, N. C. Cheung, S. W. Zhao, Y. Lu, and Z. H. Shi, "Design and simulation of a linear switched reluctance generator for wave energy conversion," in 2011 4th International Conference on Power Electronics Systems and Applications, 2011, pp. 1-5.
- [8] H. Chen, "Electromagnetic design of switched reluctance generator," in Proceedings of the International Conference

on Power Electronics and Drive Systems, 2003, vol. 1, pp. 777-780.

- [9] D. A. Torrey, "Switched reluctance generators and their control," IEEE Trans. Ind. Electron., vol. 49, no. 1, pp. 3-14, 2002.
- [10] M. R. Benhadria, K. Kendouci, and B. Mazari, "Torque Ripple Minimization of Switched Reluctance Motor Using Hysteresis Current Control," 2006 IEEE Int. Symp. Ind. Electron., vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 2158-2162, 2006.
- [11] X. D. Xue, K. W. E. Cheng, and S. L. Ho, "Optimization and evaluation of torque-sharing functions for torque ripple minimization in switched reluctance motor drives," IEEE Trans. Power Electron., vol. 24, no. 9, pp. 2076-2090, 2009.
- [12] I. Husain and M. Ehsani, "Torque ripple minimization in switched reluctance motor drives by\nPWM current control," IEEE Trans. Power Elec., vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 83-88, 1996.
- [13] I. Husain and M. Ehsani, "Torque ripple minimization in switched reluctance motor drives by\nPWM current control," IEEE Trans. Power Electron., vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 83-88, 1996.
- [14] R. C. Kavanagh, J. M. D. Murphy, and M. G. Egan, "Torque ripple minimization in switched reluctance drives using self-learning techniques," Proc. IECON '91 1991 Int. Conf. Ind. Electron. Control Instrum., pp. 289-294, 1991.
- [15] D. S. Schramm, B. W. Williams, and T. C. Green, "Torque ripple reduction of switched reluctance motors by phase current optimal profiling," PESC `92 Rec. 23rd Annu. IEEE Power Electron. Spec. Conf., pp. 857-860, 1992.
- [16] I. Husain and M. Ehsani, "Torque ripple minimization in switched reluctance motor drives by PWM current control," IEEE Transactions on Power Electronics, vol. 11, no. 1. pp. 83-88, 1996.
- [17] N. Inanc and V. Ozbulur, "Torque ripple minimization of a switched reluctance motor by using continuous sliding mode control technique," Electr. Power Syst. Res., vol. 66, no. 3, pp. 241-251, 2003.
- [18] R. R. Moghaddam, F. Magnussen, and C. Sadarangani, "Novel rotor design optimization of Synchronous Reluctance Machine for low torque ripple," in Proceedings - 2012 20th International Conference on Electrical Machines, ICEM 2012, 2012, pp. 720-724.
- [19] T. Higuchi, T. Ueda, and T. Abe, "Torque ripple reduction control of a novel segment type SRM with 2-steps slide rotor," in 2010 International Power Electronics Conference - ECCE Asia -, IPEC 2010, 2010, pp. 2175-2180.
- [20] P. Lobato, J. Martins, and a. J. Pires, "A design criteria for torque ripple reduction in Switched Reluctance Generators," 2011 Int. Conf. Power Eng. Energy Electr. Drives, no. May, pp. 1-6, 2011.
- [21] H. U. Shin, K. Park, and K. B. Lee, "A non-unity torque sharing function for torque ripple minimization of Switched Reluctance Generators in wind power systems," Energies, vol. 8, no. 10, pp. 11685-11701, 2015.
- [22] J. Castro, P. Andrada, and B. Blanque, "Minimization of torque ripple in switched reluctance motor drives using an

enhanced direct instantaneous torque control," Electr. Mach. (ICEM), ..., vol. 27, no. 1, pp. 1021-1026, 2012.

- [23] J. Beerten, J. Verveckken, and J. Driesen, "Predictive Direct Torque Control for Flux and Torque Ripple Reduction," IEEE Trans. Ind. Electron., vol. 57, no. 1, pp. 404-412, 2010.
- [24] T. H. Kim, D. H. Lee, and J. W. Ahn, "Advanced nonlinear logic torque sharing function of SRM for torque ripple reduction," in INTELEC, International Telecommunications Energy Conference (Proceedings), 2009.
- [25] J. Castro Soriano, P. Andrada Gascon, and B. Blanqué Molina, "Minimization of torque ripple in switched reluctance motor drives using an enhanced direct instantaneous control," Int. Conf. Electr. Mach., pp. 1021-1026, 2012.
- [26] M. Dowlatshahi, S. M. S. Nejad, and J. W. Ahn, "Torque ripple minimization of switched reluctance motor using modified torque sharing function," in 2013 21st Iranian Conference on Electrical Engineering, ICEE 2013, 2013.
- [27] D. H. Lee, J. Liang, Z. G. Lee, and J. W. Ahn, "A simple nonlinear logical torque sharing function for low-torque ripple SR drive," IEEE Trans. Ind. Electron., vol. 56, no. 8, pp. 3021-3028, 2009.
- [28] J. Ye, B. Bilgin, and A. Emadi, "An Offline Torque Sharing Function for Torque Ripple Reduction in Switched Reluctance Motor Drives," IEEE Trans. Energy Convers., vol. 30, no. 2, pp. 726-735, 2015.
- [29] R. Mikail, I. Husain, Y. Sozer, M. S. Islam, and T. Sebastian, "Torque-ripple minimization of switched reluctance machines through current profiling," IEEE Trans. Ind. Appl., vol. 49, no. 3, pp. 1258-1267, 2013.
- [30] Aide Xu, Chaoyi Shang, Jiagui Chen and Lele Han, "A new control method based on DTC and PMC to Reduce Torque Ripple in SRM" 2169-3536 IEEE Rapid Review, Open Access Journal, Volume 7, 2019, pp 68548-68593.
- [31] Aguemon Dourodjaye Pierre, Agbokpanzo Richard Gilles, Houngan Kokou Theophile and Vianou Antoine, "Torque Ripple Minimization in Switch Reluctance Motor Using Model Predictive Control for Water Pumping Application" Current Journal of Applied Science and Technology, 32(4): 1-9, 2019.
- [32] Pedro Jose dos Santos Neto, Tarcio Andre dos Santos Barros, Marcelo Vinicius de Paula, Ramon Rodrigues de Sousa and Ernesto Ruppert Filho, "Design of Computational Experiment for Performance Optimization of a Switched Reluctance Generator in Wind Systems" IEEE Transactions on Energy Conversion, Volume 33, no.1, 2018. Pp406-419
- [33] M. Divandari and A. Dadpour, "Radial force and torque ripple optimization for acoustic noise reduction of SRM drives via fuzzy logic control," in 2010 9th IEEE/IAS International Conference on Industry Applications, INDUSCON 2010, 2010.
- [34] M. Divandari, A. Koochaki, A. Maghsoodloo, H. Rastegar, and J. Noparast, "High performance SRM drive with hybrid observer and fuzzy logic torque ripple minimization," in IEEE International Symposium on Industrial Electronics, 2007, pp. 1230-1235.
- [35] M. Divandari, R. Brazamini, A. Dadpour, and M. Jazaeri, "A novel dynamic observer and torque ripple minimization via fuzzy logic for SRM drives," in IEEE International Symposium on Industrial Electronics, 2009, pp. 847-852.
- [36] H.-S. Ro, K.-G. Lee, J.-S. Lee, H.-G. Jeong, and K.-B. Lee, "Torque Ripple Minimization Scheme Using Torque Sharing Function Based Fuzzy Logic Control for a

Switched Reluctance Motor," J. Electr. Eng. Technol., vol. 10, no. 1, pp. 118-127, 2015.

- [37] S. Mir, M. E. Elbuluk, and I. Husain, "Torque-ripple minimization in switched reluctance motors using adaptive fuzzy control," IEEE Trans. Ind. Appl., vol. 35, no. 2, pp. 461-468, 1999.
- [38] L. Yi, G. Wang, H. Peng, W. Li, and Z. Huang, "Research of restraining torque ripple reduction by fuzzy logic controller in SRM based on the nonlinear model," in 2008 World Automation Congress, WAC 2008, 2008.
- [39] P. H. Truong, D. Flieller, N. K. Nguyen, J. Mercklé, and G. Sturtzer, "Torque ripple minimization in non-sinusoidal synchronous reluctance motors based on artificial neural networks," Electr. Power Syst. Res., vol. 140, pp. 37-45, 2016.
- [40] N. Kumar, "Torque Control in Switched Reluctance Motor by BFO Optimization," vol. 2, no. 7, pp. 1706-1710, 2014.
- [41] L. Kalaivani, P. Subburaj, and M. Willjuice Iruthayarajan, "Speed control of switched reluctance motor with torque ripple reduction using non-dominated sorting genetic algorithm (NSGA-II)," Int. J. Electr. Power Energy Syst., vol. 53, pp. 69-77, 2013.
- [42] X. Gao, X. Wang, Z. Li, and Y. Zhou, "A Review of Torque Ripple Control StReluctance Motor," Int. J. Control Autom., vol. 8, no. 4, pp. 103-116, 2015.
- [43] K. Vijayakumar, R. Karthikeyan, S. Paramasivam, R. Arumugam, and K. N. Srinivas, "Switched reluctance motor modeling, design, simulation, and analysis: A comprehensive review," IEEE Trans. Magn., vol. 44, no. 12, pp. 4605-4617, 2008.
- [44] R. Suryadevara and B. G. Fernandes, "Control techniques for torque ripple minimization in switched reluctance motor: An overview," in 2013 IEEE 8th International Conference on Industrial and Information Systems, ICIIS 2013 - Conference Proceedings, 2013, pp. 24-29.
- [45] C. Sikder, I. Husain, and Y. Sozer, "Switched reluctance generator controls for optimal power generation with current regulation," 2012 IEEE Energy Convers. Congr. Expo. ECCE 2012, pp. 4322-4329, 2012.
- [46] Y. C. Chang and C. M. Liaw, "On the design of power circuit and control scheme for switched reluctance generator," IEEE Trans. Power Electron., vol. 23, no. 1, pp. 445-454, 2008.
- [47] L. Moreau, M. Machmoum, and M. E. Zaim, "Control and Minimization of Torque Ripple in Switched Reluctance Generator," Eur. Conf. Power Electron. Appl., pp. 1-8, 2005.
- [48] I. Husain, "Minimization of torque ripple in SRM drives," IEEE Trans. Ind. Electron., vol. 49, no. 1, pp. 28-39, 2002.
- [49] K. C. Yong and S. K. Chang, "Pole shape optimization of switched reluctance motor for reduction of torque ripple," in 12th Biennial IEEE Conference on Electromagnetic Field Computation, CEFC 2006, 2006.
- [50] M. A. Tavakkoli and M. Moallem, "Torque ripple mitigation of double stator switched reluctance motor (DSSRM) using a novel rotor shape optimization," in 2012 IEEE Energy Conversion Congress and Exposition, ECCE 2012, 2012, pp. 848-852.
- [51] K. C. Yong, S. Y. Hee, and S. K. Chang, "Pole-shape optimization of a switched-reluctance motor for torque ripple reduction," in IEEE Transactions on Magnetics, 2007, vol. 43, no. 4, pp. 1797-1800.
- [52] J. E. S and S. K. S, "Torque Ripple Minimization of switched reluctance drives - A survey," Power Electron. Mach. Drives (PEMD 2010), 5th IET Int. Conf., 2010.
- [53] X.-L. Wang, Z.-L. Xu, and C. Wang, "Torque ripple and copper losses minimization control study of switched

reluctance motor," Dianji yu Kongzhi Xuebao/Electric Mach. Control, vol. 19, no. 7, p. 52-57 and 65, 2015.

- [54] F. Şahin, H. Bülent Ertan, and K. Leblebicioğlu, "Optimum geometry for torque ripple minimization of switched reluctance motors," IEEE Trans. Energy Convers., vol. 15, no. 1, pp. 30-39, 2000.
- [55] M. S. Islam and I. Husain, "Torque-ripple minimization with indirect position and speed sensing for switched reluctance motors," IEEE Trans. Ind. Electron., vol. 47, no. 5, pp. 1126-1133, 2000.
- [56] S. K. Sahoo, S. K. Panda, and J.-X. X. J.-X. Xu, "Indirect torque control of switched reluctance motors using iterative learning control," IEEE Trans. Power Electron., vol. 20, no. 4, pp. 318-326, 2005.
- [57] R. B. Inderka, R. W. A. A. De Doncker, and R. W. a. a. De Doncker, "DITC-direct instantaneous torque control of switched reluctance drives," IEEE Trans. Ind. Appl., vol. 39, no. 4, pp. 1046-1051, 2003.
- [58] P. Srinivas and P. V. N. Prasad, "Torque Ripple Minimization of 4 Phase 8 / 6 Switched Reluctance Motor Drive with Direct Instantaneous Torque Control," vol. 3, no. 4, pp. 488-497, 2011.
- [59] J. Sun, Y. Wang, F. Bai, and F. Sun, "Simulation of the Direct Instantaneous Torque Control of SRM using MATLAB," Int. Conf. Autom. Control Artif. Intell. (ACAI 2012), pp. 1850-1853, 2012.
- [60] T. Kojima and R. W. De Doncker, "Optimal torque sharing in direct instantaneous torque control of switched reluctance motors," in 2015 IEEE Energy Conversion Congress and Exposition, ECCE 2015, 2015, pp. 327-333.
- [61] S. K. Sahoo, S. Dasgupta, S. K. Panda, and J. X. Xu, "A lyapunov function-based robust direct torque controller for a switched reluctance motor drive system," IEEE Trans. Power Electron., vol. 27, no. 2, pp. 555-564, 2012.
- [62] V. P. Vujičić, "Minimization of torque ripple and copper losses in switched reluctance drive," IEEE Trans. Power Electron., vol. 27, no. 1, pp. 388-399, 2012.
- [63] C. C. C. Choi, S. K. S. Kim, Y. K. Y. Kim, and K. P. K. Park, "A new torque control method of a switched reluctance motor using a torque-sharing function," IEEE Trans. Magn., vol. 38, no. 5, pp. 3288-3290, 2002.
- [64] J. Ye, B. Bilgin, and A. Emadi, "An extended-speed lowripple torque control of switched reluctance motor drives," IEEE Trans. Power Electron., vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 1457-1470, 2015.
- [65] D. S. Reay, M. Mirkazemimoud, T. C. Green, and B. W. Williams, "Switched Reluctance Motor Control Via Fuzzy Adaptive Systems," Ieee Control Syst. Mag., vol. 15, no. 3, pp. 8-14, 1995.
- [66] A. Tahour, H. Abid, and A. G. Aissaoui, "Adaptive Neuro-Fuzzy Controller of Switched Reluctance Motor," SERBIAN J. Electr. Eng., vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 23-34, 2007.
- [67] W. A. Arakat, A. Y. Haikal, and A. H. Kassem, "Adaptive Neuro-fuzzy Controller for Multi-layered Switched Reluctance Motor," Int. J. Comput. Appl., vol. 44, no. 1, pp. 975-8887, 2012.
- [68] C. L. Tseng, S. Y. Wang, S. C. Chien, and C. Y. Chang, "Development of a self-tuning TSK-fuzzy speed control strategy for switched reluctance motor," IEEE Trans. Power Electron., vol. 27, no. 4, pp. 2141-2152, 2012.
- [69] A. S. A. Song, Y. C. Y. Cao, and D. G. D. Gu, "Study of based Fuzzy-PID control for switched reluctance motor," Comput. Des. Appl. ICCDA 2010 Int. Conf., vol. 3, no. Iccda, pp. 558-561, 2010.
- [70] S.-C. Wang and Y.-H. Liu, "A Modified PI-Like Fuzzy Logic Controller for Switched Reluctance Motor Drives,"

IEEE Trans. Ind. Electron., vol. 58, no. 5, pp. 1812-1825, 2011.

- [71] M. Rodrigues, P. J. Costa Branco, and W. Suemitsu, "Fuzzy logic torque ripple reduction by turn-off angle compensation for switched reluctance motors," IEEE Trans. Ind. Electron., vol. 48, no. 3, pp. 711-715, 2001.
- [72] L. Kalaivani, N. S. Marimuthu, and P. Subburaj, "Intelligent control for torque-ripple minimization in switched reluctance motor," in 2011 1st International Conference on Electrical Energy Systems, ICEES 2011, 2011, pp. 182-186.
- [73] H. Tahersima, M. Kazemsaleh, M. Tahersima, and N. Hamedi, "Optimization of speed control algorithm to achieve minimum torque ripple for a switched reluctance motor drive via GA," in 2011 4th International Conference on Power Electronics Systems and Applications, PESA 2011, 2011.
- [74] M. J. Navardi, B. Babaghorbani, and A. Ketabi, "Efficiency improvement and torque ripple minimization of Switched Reluctance Motor using FEM and Seeker Optimization Algorithm," Energy Convers. Manag., vol. 78, pp. 237-244, 2014.
- [75] B. Ganji, M. Heidarian and J. Faiz. "Modeling and Analysis of Switched Reluctance Generator using Finite Element Method". Ain Shams Engineering Journal, volume 6 pp85-93, 2015. Home Page: www.sciencedirect.com, www.elsivier.com/locate/asej
- [76] J. Gao, H. Sun, L. He, Y. Dong, and Y. Zheng, "Optimization design of Switched Reluctance Motor based on Particle Swarm Optimization," Electrical Machines and Systems (ICEMS), 2011 International Conference on. pp. 1-5, 2011.
- [77] M. Balaji and V. Kamaraj, "Design optimization of Switched Reluctance Machine using Particle Swarm Optimization," 2011 1st Int. Conf. Electr. Energy Syst., vol. 7, no. 6, pp. 164-169, 2011.
- [78] W. Phuangmalai, M. Konghirun, and N. Chayopitak, "A design study of 4/2 switched reluctance motor using particle swarm optimization," in 2012 9th International Conference on Electrical Engineering/Electronics, Computer, Telecommunications and Information Technology, 2012, pp. 1-4.
- [79] C. Ma and L. Qu, "Multiobjective Optimization of Switched Reluctance Motors Based on Design of Experiments and Particle Swarm Optimization," IEEE Trans. Energy Convers., 2015.
- [80] J. Gao, H. Sun, L. He, Y. Dong, and Y. Zheng, "Optimization design of Switched Reluctance Motor based on Particle Swarm Optimization," in 2011 International Conference on Electrical Machines and Systems, 2011, pp. 1-5.
- [81] Naggar H.Saad, Ahmed A. El-Sattar and Mohamed E. Metally. "Artificial Neural Controller for Torque Ripple Control and Maximum Power Extraction for Wind System Driven by Switched Reluctance Generator". Ain Shams Engineering Journal, Home Page: www.sciencedirect.com volume 9, pp2255-2264, 2018.
- [82] Mohamed E. Metally, Naggar H. Saad, and Ahmed A. El-Sattar, "Sensorless Control of Switched Reluctance Generator with Maximum Power Extraction Wind Driven Based on MO-PSO" International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems (IJEAIS), ISSN: 2000-000X, Volume 1, Issue 10, 2017. Pp13-24.
- [83] Zeki Omak and Ceren Cevahir. "Control of Switched Reluctance Generator in Wind Power System application for Variable Speed". Ain Shams Engineering Journal, pp1-8 2021. Home Page: www.sciencedirect.com,

Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third-party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons license, unless indicated

otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this license, visit https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

© The Author(s) 2023